

A Regulatory Burden:

The Compliance Dimension of Regulating CO_2 as a Pollutant

For the U.S. Chamber of Commerce

Principal Researcher: Portia M. E. Mills Strategic Advisor/Analyst: Mark P. Mills

September 2008



ι

.

Executive Summary

Estimates of the costs of restricting carbon dioxide (CO₂) emissions have generally focused on the penalties arising from the associated direct or indirect increases in the cost of energy. Since hydrocarbons provide 85 percent of all U.S. energy, such fuel-cost penalties could be substantial and widespread. But generally missing from economic analyses to date is inclusion of the regulatory and bureaucratic costs from complying with and enforcing federal pollution laws should the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency regulate CO₂ and other greenhouse gases under the Clean Air Act (CAA).

Classifying CO_2 as a pollutant and regulating it under the CAA, or similar, domains would bring to force all the necessary related tracking, reporting and enforcement authorities. Many large enterprises (notably electric utilities, chemical plants, etc.) already accommodate the costs, and risks, of federal regulatory compliance. However, establishing operations and procedures to comply with federal Clean Air Act regulations would be a new experience for most small and mid-sized businesses, especially those that do not have infrastructure for such regulatory regimes, the staff time, consulting support and legal services. There is as well an associated potential risk for penalties arising from errors in compliance, recording, documenting or reporting. For many to-be-regulated businesses, it is possible that compliance costs could exceed the direct fuel price increase anticipated in a CO_2 -constrained world.

Under proposed modifications to the CAA, a business would become a regulated "stationary source" if it emits over 250 tons per year (TPY) of CO_2 .¹ On average, this emissions threshold is reached when a business uses about \$70,000² of oil or natural gas per year in "stationary" equipment (i.e., not cars, trucks and similar). How many commercial businesses, manufacturers and farms exceed this threshold?

By analyzing U.S. Census and Energy Information Administration data for energy consumption in manufacturing, commercial buildings, and farming, this report finds that at 250 TPY for CO₂, a total of over one million businesses³ involved in manufacturing, operating buildings and services, and farming could become subject to new EPA regulations, monitoring, controls and enforcement.

- At least one million mid-sized to large commercial buildings emit enough CO₂ per year to become EPA regulated stationary sources. The threshold would be reached, for example, by one-fifth of all food service businesses, one-third of those in health care, half of those in the lodging industry, even 10 percent of buildings used for religious worship.
- Nearly 200,000 manufacturing operations would become regulated CO₂ sources. For the majority of industries, the average sized operation is big enough (in terms of emissions) to trigger the 250 TPY emissions threshold. At the top of the list are chemicals, metal fabrication, food processing, minerals, plastics, paper, and electrical equipment.
- About 20,000 large farms emit enough CO₂ per year to become regulated stationary emissions sources. At the top of the list are greenhouses and nurseries, poultry and egg production, vegetable and melon farms, pig and dairy farms. (Limitations in primary data do not permit a complete analysis, and the number is likely an underestimate.)

¹ Note that a small number of specifically designated industrial enterprises (e.g. oil refineries) would trigger this provision at a 100 ton-per-year level. This analysis incorporates those exceptions as indicated in relevant tables in this document.

² Calculating 250 TPY in terms of dollars: assume \$10 per 1000 cubic feet natural gas, or \$3 per gallon oil yields ~ 7 lbs CO2/\$

³ These estimates likely underestimate the impact because of limitations in the primary data.

A Regulatory Burden: The Compliance Dimension of Regulating CO2 as a Pollutant

Executive Summary Tables The number and types of businesses potentially subject to proposed CO₂ regulation

Table 1: Industrial Sector Summary

Business type	Estimated # establishments regulated @ 250 TPY	Total Site CO ₂ emissions subject to reg
		million tons
Fabricated Metal Products	26,000	9
Food	15,000	50
Machinery	12,000	3
Nonmetallic Mineral Products	11,000	60
Printing and Related Support	9,300	1
Plastics and Rubber Products	9,200	7
Chemicals	8,900	200
Wood Products	8,400	3
Transportation Equipment	7,300	10
Computer and Electronic Products	7,200	3
Miscellaneous	5,100	1
Paper	4,200	60
Primary Metals	4,200	100
Furniture and Related Products	3,600	0
Apparel	3,600	1
Electrical Equip., Appliances	3,500	3
Textile Product Mills	2,900	1
Textile Mills	2,200	7
Petroleum and Coal Products	1,900	50
Beverage and Tobacco Products	1,600	5
Iron and Steel Mills*	770	100
Semiconductors, Related Devices	550	1
Leather and Allied Products	360	0
Petroleum Refineries*	210	50
Cements*	190	30
Lime*	65	7
Primary Aluminum*	41	1
Pulp Mills*	34	2
Total**	190,000	600
Total CO, including kWh		1.000

* Calculated for 100 TPY

** Total different from column due to rounding

Executive Summary Tables The number and types of businesses potentially subject to proposed CO₂ regulation

Table 2: Commercial Sector Summary

Business type	Estimated # establishments regulated @ 250 TPY	Total Site CO ₂ emissions subject to reg
		million tons
Office	260,000	30
Warehouse and Storage	150,000	10
Mercantile	140,000	30
Education	100,000	30
Health Care	92,000	30
Lodging	71,000	20
Service	67,000	3
Food Service	58,000	10
Religious Worship	37,000	1
Public Assembly	26,000	8
Food Sales	23,000	4
Other	7,900	5
Public Order and Safety	7,100	2
Total*	1,000,000	200

* Total different from column due to rounding

Table 3: Agricultural Sector Summary

Business type	Estimated # establishments regulated @ 250 TPY	Total Site CO ₂ emissions subject to reg
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		million tons
Oil seed, grain	3,400	9
Other Crop Farming Total	2,600	5
Poultry and egg	1,100	2
Vegetable, melon	1,500	2
Greenhouse, nursery, floriculture	1,400	2
Beef cattle ranching	920	5
Dairy cattle, milk production	910	2
Fruit and tree nut	880	1
Cattle feedlots	630	1
Hog and pig	560	1
Animal aquaculture, other	420	1
Sheep and goat	50	0
Total	1,000,000	40

Methodology

This study is intended to provide a reasonable estimate of the universe of stationary sources potentially exposed to Prevention of Significant Deterioration (PSD) permitting requirements should greenhouse gases become regulated pollutants under the Clean Air Act. Under the CAA, should CO₂ be deemed "regulated" in any way, no new or existing "major" stationary source of CO2 can be built or modified (if the modification increases net emissions) without first obtaining a PSD permit. Major sources are defined as either a source in one of 28 listed categories (mostly industrial manufacturers and energy producers) with the potential to emit at least 100 tons per year of an air pollutant, or any other source with the potential to emit 250 tons per year (TPY) of an air pollutant. EPA defines "potential to emit" (PTE) as "the maximum capacity of a stationary source to emit a pollutant under its physical and operational design, including certain legal limitations, for example, on emissions or hours of operation."

The results in this report emerge from an analysis of macro-economic and energy data, by sector, from the Energy Information Administration (EIA), U.S. Census and similar. The (calculated) CO_2 emissions are based on reported total on-site fuel consumption by relevant sector categories (types of buildings, factories, or farms). While aggregate energy data are deemed to be reasonably accurate, EIA and Census data become weaker (leading to under-reporting) the more finely the data are disaggregated and more specific the source. Nonetheless, the actual aggregate energy use (and thus actual CO_2 emissions) provide a reasonable starting point to estimate the number of buildings, factories, or farms that appear to emit enough CO_2 to cross the 250 TPY threshold (or 100 TPY threshold). The results of the analysis provide an estimate of the total universe of buildings likely exposed to potential PSD permitting should new construction or modifications be undertaken.

EPA has conducted its own analysis of the potential number of permits required by PSD.⁴ However, rather than using reported sector energy data, EPA instead chose to calculate and estimate emissions from the 'bottom' up. In doing so, EPA employed a "capacity factor" based on what EPA assumes to be the level of operations of reported energy-using equipment. For instance, EPA assumes the restaurant and food service sector only uses its equipment to ten percent of capacity, so it applies a ten percent capacity factor to that sector. Capacity factors are notoriously difficult to know, or obtain. (Capacity factors applicable to industrial boilers range from 25 to 66 percent.) By reducing the number of PTEexposed sectors by anywhere from 40 to 90 percent, EPA's analysis results in a sample size much smaller than the one used here. EPA also lists a series of "uncertainties" that differ from this study, including: no estimates for the agricultural sector (Note: EPA incorrectly asserts that there are no on-site CO, emissions from combustion in agriculture); no estimates of PSD permits required for modifications; and no consideration of existing major sources for other pollutants that will be exposed to PSD for CO₂. However, the basic methodology EPA used to determine the number of buildings exposed to PSD setting aside EPA's "capacity factor" de-rating, stated uncertainties, variables—is similar to that used here, and EPA's initial estimates of sources meeting PTE thresholds for CO₂ are in the same order-ofmagnitude as that found in this analysis.

"Estimates of Facilities that Emit CO, in Excess of 100 and 250 tpy thresholds," prepared by EPA staff, May 2008.

4

Industrial-Manufacturing Sector

The majority of establishments in the industrial-manufacturing sector emit over 250 TPY. For some of these businesses, an operation as small as 1,000 square feet is sufficient to emit 250 TPY – e.g. chemicals and metals where the average sized operation is over 100,000 square feet.⁵ On-site emissions intensity in industrial operations varies widely, from several thousand pounds CO_2 per square foot in heavy material and mineral industries, to 10 to 30 lbs per square foot for furniture, printing, computer and semiconductor industries. (See Table 5.)

Even dominantly electricity-intensive businesses, like semiconductor and related tech industries, are large enough users of hydrocarbons to become regulated entities. A semiconductor manufacturer larger than 20,000 square feet, and computer maker larger than 45,000 square feet, would exceed the 250 TPY regulated threshold. The *average* semiconductor operation is over 175,000 square feet, and computer makers average almost 100,000 square feet. Thus nearly every semiconductor business, and about half the computer and electronics industry would be subject to CO_2 regulatory compliance. At the other end of the tech spectrum are food processing businesses, where the average facility is over 100,000 square feet. Food processors hit the 250 TPY threshold with only 3,500 square feet of operations.

For many industries, the more CO_2 is emitted indirectly from their use of electricity, and thus the associated utility emissions, than from site combustion; e.g.; textiles, computers, wood products. Using the computer and semiconductor industry examples again, where on-site fuel use leads to 12 and 26 pounds of CO_2 per square foot respectively – their electricity use equals 75 and 176 pounds, respectively, of CO_2 per square foot because of average utility fuel use to make the kilowatt-hours. (See Table 6.) Consequently, of the approximately 600 millions TPY of total industrial CO_2 emissions subject to on-site regulation identified in this report, at least as much again is emitted by electric utilities to serve those industries.⁶

Many businesses may find it desirable to increase electric intensity (use more electric, instead of fuelburning technologies – a long-standing trend) to attempt to drop below the regulatory threshold, and shift the CO_2 regulatory burden to electric utilities. The industrial sector, overall, is the least electrified part of the stationary energy economy, with less than 25 percent of total energy needs supplied from electric utilities. Many new and emerging electric technologies have inherent productivity benefits over combustion-based equipment (e.g., faster, more uniform drying times for electric infrared heaters vs gas heaters). A CO_2 regulatory regime could have the effect of accelerating turn-over in, or biasing new purchases towards, electric-based capital equipment. This would create the unintended consequence of increasing growth in electric demand – a "dash to electricity" – and increase CO_2 emissions from utilities.

A "dash to electricity" by facilities trying to avoid triggering CO_2 permit requirements would not only further strain the electric supply system, but would likely exacerbate the emerging problem associated with the utility industry's "dash to gas" as the primary means to generate electricity. A recent

⁵ EPA proposes a small number of specifically designated industrial enterprises would trigger this provision at a 100 ton-per-year level. This analysis incorporates those exceptions as indicated by an *.

⁶ Total CO₂ emissions calculated from the available data yields ~ 600 million TPY, which is significantly lower than the > 1,000 tons of total aggregate CO₂ emissions identified by DOE/EIA for the overall industrial sector. This difference results from the limitations of the primary data as disaggregated by sector: many companies do not report (for proprietary or competitive reasons) specific uses of fuels. Thus the data available under-counts total industrial fuel use – and thus CO₂ emissions for specific industrial sectors.

Industrial-Manufacturing Sector continued

Department of Energy report highlights the challenges with the U.S. natural gas system meeting current needs, and the attendant expected rapid growth in the need for LNG imports from many of the same regions where the U.S. is currently dependent on oil imports.7

Table 4: Summary of Typical Industrial-Manufacturing Categories

- Food and Kindred Products
- Meat Packing Plants
- **Canned Fruit and Vegetables**
- Frozen Fruits and Vegetables
- Wet Corn Milling
- Bread, Cake, and Related Products
- **Cane Sugar Refining**
- **Beet Sugar**
- Soybean Oil Mills
- Malt Beverages
- Textile Mill Products
- Apparel and Other Textile Products
- Lumber and Wood Products
- Furniture and Fixtures
- Wood Furniture, Except Upholstered
- Paper and Allied Products
- Paper Mills
- Paperboard Mills
- Printing and Publishing
- **Chemicals and Allied Products**
- Alkalis and Chlorine

- Industrial Glass Inorganic Pigments
- Industrial Inorganic Chemicals
- Plastic Materials and Resins
- Synthetic Rubber
- Cellulosic Manmade Fibers
- Organic Fibers, Noncellulosic
- Gum and Wood Chemicals
- Cyclic Crudes and Intermediates
- Industrial Organic Chemicals
- Nitrogenous Fertilizers
- **Phosphatic Fertilizers**
- Petroleum and Coal Products
- Petroleum Refining
- **Rubber and Miscellaneous** Plastic Products
- Tires and Inner Tubes
- **Miscellaneous Plastics Products**
- Stone, Clay, and Glass Products
- Fret Glass
- **Glass Containers**
- Pressed and Blown Glass
- Cement, Hydraulic
- Lime

- Mineral Wool
- Primary Metal Industries
- Blast Furnace and Basic Steel Products
- Blast Furnaces and Steel Mills
- **Electrometallurgical Products**
- Gray and Ductile Iron Foundries
- Primary Copper
- Primary Aluminum .
- **Primary Nonferrous Metals**
- Aluminum Sheet, Plate, and Foil
- Fabricated Metal Products
- Industrial Machinery and Equipment
- Computer and Office Equipment
- Electronic and Other Electric Equipment
- Transportation Equipment
- Motor Vehicles and Car Bodies
- Motor Vehicle Parts and Acces-. sories
- Instruments and Related Products
- Surgical and Medical Instruments
- Natural Gas and Electricity Impacts on Industry: White Paper on Expected Near Term Cost Increases, DOE National Energy Technologies Laboratory, April 28, 2008, DoE/NETL-2008/1320: "The decline in EIA's AEO2008 forecast for natural gas supply from the AEO2001 forecast for year 2020 alone, excluding LNG, is roughly 13Tcf, or nearly equivalent to the expected annual supply from ten Alaskan pipelines. Domestic production is projected to decline steadily, failing below 20 Tcf by 2030. Disappointing U.S. production, declining Canadian imports, minimal LNG imports to date, and the continued rise in the price of oil have caused natural gas prices to more than triple between 2002 and today." "In the event of climate change legislation, running existing natural gas combined cycle units at higher capacity factors can displace 20- 35% of current coal kilowatt-hours. Such substitution requires another 5.4 TCF per year. Clearly, the existing natural gas fleet cannot meet the growth in peak demand expected before 2016 and also substitute for coal to meet carbon caps."

7

Industrial-Manufacturing Sector continued

Table 5: Summary of Industrial-Manufacturing Sector CO $_{\rm 2}$ Emissions: Ranked by Minimum Size of Establishment to Reach 250 TPY CO $_{\rm 2}$

Business type	Size to emit 250 TPY	Average floor space per establishment	Site CO ₂ emissions	Estimated # establishments regulated @ 250 TPY	Total # establishments
	sq ft	sq ft	lbs/sq ft		
Lime*	14	31,000	15,000	65	65
Cements*	41	110,000	4,900	190	200
Petroleum Refineries*	80	590,000	2,500	210	220
Iron and Steel Mills*	160	330,000	1,200	770	770
Pulp Mills*	330	490,000	610	34	34
Petroleum and Coal Products	360	58,000	1,400	1,900	1,900
Chemicals	940	110,000	530	8,900	8,900
Primary Metals	1,100	170,000	440	4,200	4,200
Nonmetallic Mineral Products	2,100	75,000	240	11,000	12,000
Paper	2,300	180,000	220	4,200	4,300
Primary Aluminum*	2,500	900,000	80	41	41
Food	3,400	100,000	150	15,000	15,000
Textile Mills	8,800	200,000	60	2,200	2,200
Beverage and Tobacco Products	9,000	160,000	60	1,600	1,600
Semiconductors, Related Devices	19,000	180,000	30	550	580
Transportation Equipment	22,000	220,000	20	7,300	7,700
Plastics and Rubber Products	24,000	94,000	20	9,200	11,000
Electrical Equip., Appliances	25,000	120,000	20	3,500	3,900
Fabricated Metal Products	25,000	48,000	20	26,000	35,000
Wood Products	26,000	65,000	20	8,400	10,000
Apparel	29,000	43,000	20	3,600	5,500
Textile Product Mills	33,000	100,000	10	2,900	3,500
Leather and Allied Products	35,000	38,000	10	360	690
Printing and Related Support	40,000	37,000	10	9,300	20,000
Machinery	43,000	72,000	10	12,000	17,000
Computer and Electronic Products	43,000	96,000	10	7,200	9,200
Miscellaneous	54,000	40,000	9	5,100	16,000
Furniture and Related Products	82,000	61,000	6	3,600	11,000
Total**			·	190,000	A

* Calculations are for 100 TPY

**Total different from column due to rounding

Industrial-Manufacturing Sector continued

Table 6:

Summary of Industrial-Manufacturing Sector CO, Emissions Arising from Electricity Use (Emissions from Electric Utilities Allocated by Industrial Site Use)

Business type	Electricity CO ₂ emissions allocated to site	Site CO ₂ emissions	Electricity as Share Total Energy	Floor space to reach 250 TPY from electric use	Average floor space per establishment
	lbs/sq ft	lbs/sq ft	%	sq ft	sq ft
Lime*	1,800	15,000	10	280	31,000
Cements*	1,500	4,900	20	340	110,000
Petroleum Refineries*	1,200	2,500	5	430	590,000
Petroleum and Coal Products	620	1,400	5	810	58,000
Iron and Steel Mills*	440	1,200	20	1,100	330,000
Pulp Mills*	340	610	6	1,500	490,000
Primary Metals	340	440	30	1,500	170,000
Chemicals	300	530	20	1,700	110,000
Semiconductors	180	30	50	2,800	180,000
Paper	150	220	20	3,400	180,000
Textile Mills	130	60	40	3,900	200,000
Food	120	150	30	4,300	100,000
Nonmetallic Mineral Products	110	240	20	4,700	75,000
Plastics and Rubber Products	90	20	40	5,500	94,000
Computer and Electronic Products	75	10	50	6,700	96,000
Wood Products	60	20	30	8,200	65,000
Transportation Equipment	60	20	40	8,500	220,000
Electrical Equip., Appliances	60	20	30	8,500	120,000
Beverage and Tobacco Products	50	60	30	9,100	160,000
Fabricated Metal Products	50	20	40	10,000	48,000
Printing and Related Support	40	10	40	11,000	37,000
Apparel	40	20	40	12,000	43,000
Machinery	40	10	40	13,000	72,000
Miscellaneous	30	9	40	15,000	40,000
Textile Product Mills	30	10	30	18,000	100,000
Leather and Allied Products	30	10	40	18,000	38,000
Furniture and Related Products	20	6	40	26,000	61,000
Primary Aluminum*	N/A	80	N/A	N/A	900,000

* Calculations are for 100 TPY

Commercial Sector

Like the industrial sector, the commercial sector uses lots of fuel. Unlike the industrial sector, fuel purchases are heavily weighted towards electricity; 80 percent of total commercial energy is supplied by electric utilities. Thus, given the importance of coal for the electric supply system (>50 percent of national generation), the effect of directly, or indirectly, taxing carbon will have an inordinately large effect on the commercial sector's cost of energy.

Nonetheless, many of the commercial sector's buildings use enough carbon-based fuels to face the same kinds of regulatory costs, controls, and enforcement from EPA that the industrial sector would in a regulated CO₂ regime.

Energy use varies by building type – but within a far narrower range than industrial operations. Commercial buildings emit from a few pounds of CO_2 per square foot (e.g., office buildings) to 10 to 15 pounds CO_2 per square foot in health care and food services. On average, a building with over 40,000 square feet uses enough hydrocarbons to become a regulated source.

Using data for each type of commercial building, energy use and size, we estimate that a total of over 1,000,000 commercial buildings would become classified as new regulated stationary emissions sources. This would include over one-fourth of all school buildings, over two-thirds of health care facilities, one-third of office buildings, half of those in lodging, and one-fifth of food services. (See Table 8.) Hotels and resorts emit a relatively low 6 pounds CO_2 per square foot, but need only be over 80,000 square feet in size to hit the regulatory threshold (80,000 square feet is only two to three times the size of many hotel ballrooms alone). Food services (restaurants, etc.) are heavily electrified and emit on average only 14 pounds of CO_2 per square foot, but that's enough to be subject to regulation with a 30,000 square foot operation.

For every class of commercial building, emissions per square foot associated with electricity (not on site, but at the utility) exceed the on-site emissions from combustion. Office buildings emit 23, hotels about 18, and food services about 50 pounds of CO_2 per square foot associated with their electricity use – each respectively eight times, three times and almost four times more than on-site emissions. Still, because many commercial buildings are large enough fuel users to trigger the CO_2 regulatory threshold, here as with the industrial sector, many building owners may seek increased use of electric technologies as a means to fall below thresholds for CO_2 regulations. (See Table 9.)

Commercial Sector continued

Table 7: Examples of Commercial Sector Categories

- Accessory Stores
- Amusement, Theme Parks
- Amusement Parks
- Art Dealers
- Art Drama and Music Schools
- Auto and Home Supply Stores
- Automotive Repair Shops
- Bakes Goods Stores
- Bakeries
- Botanical and Zoological Gardens
- Cafeterias
- Carpet and Upholstery Cleaning
- Casino Hotels
- Catalog and Mail-Order Houses
- Caterers
- Children's Hospitals
- Colleges Universities and Professional Schools
- Continuing Care Retirement
 Communities

- Department Stores
- Diaper Service
- Dinner Theaters
- Dry-Cleaning Plants
- Eating and Drinking Places
- Family Planning Centers
- Fish and Seafood Markets
- Fitness and Recreational Sports Centers (pt)
- Full Service Restaurants
- General Medical and Surgical Hospitals
- Golf Clubs
- Grocery Stores
- Historical Sites
- HMO Medical Centers
- Hotels and Motels
- (except Casino Hotels)
- Industrial Launderers
- Libraries
- Linen Supply

- Medical Supply
- Medical Laboratories
- Men's Accessory Stores
- Men's Clothing Stores
- Mental Health Facilities
- Museums
- Offices of Lawyers
- Offices of Physicians
- Operators of Apartment Buildings
- Personal Appliance Stores
- Pet and Pet Supply Stores
- Psychiatric Hospitals
- Recreation Clubs and Facilities
- Stadium Operators
- Supermarket and Grocery Stores
- Warehouse Clubs and General Merchandise Stores
- Zoos and Botanical Gardens

Table 8: Summary of Commercial Sector CO₂ Emissions: Ranked by Minimum Size of Establishment to Reach 250 TPY CO₂

Business type	Size to emit 250 TPY	Mean building size	Site CO ₂ emissions	Estimated # buildings regulated @ 250 TPY	Total # buildings
	sq ft	sq ft	lbs/sq ft		
Food Service	34,000	5,600	15	58,000	297,000
Health Care	51,000	25,000	10	92,000	129,000
Lodging	81,000	36,000	6	71,000	142,000
Other	83,000	22,000	6	7,900	79,000
Public Order and Safety	110,000	16,000	4	7,100	71,000
Public Assembly	120,000	14,000	4	26,000	277,000
Service	120,000	6,500	4	67,000	622,000
Education	120,000	26,000	4	100,000	386,000
Food Sales	130,000	5,600	4	23,000	226,000
Religious Worship	150,000	10,000	3	37,000	370,000
Mercantile	160,000	17,000	3	140,000	657,000
Office	170,000	15,000	3	260,000	824,000
Warehouse and Storage	290,000	17,000	2	150,000	597,000
Total	-			1,000,000	4,859,000

Commercial Sector continued

Table 9: Summary of Commercial Sector CO₂ Emissions Arising from Electricity Use (Emissions from Electric Utilities Allocated by Commercial Site Use)

Business type	Electricity CO ₂ emissions allocated to site	Site CO ₂ emissions	Electricity as Share Total Energy	Floor space to reach 250 TPY from electric use	Mean floor space per establishment
	ibs/sq ft	lbs/sq ft	%	sq ft	sq ft
Food Sales	70	4	90	7,700	5,600
Food Service	50	15	80	9,700	5,600
Health Care	30	10	70	16,000	25,000
Other	30	6	80	17,000	22,000
Mercantile	30	3	90	19,000	17,000
Office	20	3	90	22,000	15,000
Public Order and Safety	20	4	80	24,000	16,000
Lodging	20	6	70	28,000	36,000
Public Assembly	20	4	80	30,000	14,000
Education	10	4	80	34,000	26,000
Service	10	4	80	35,000	6,500
Warehouse and Storage	10	2	80	53,000	17,000
Religious Worship	6	3	70	77,000	10,000

* Calculations are for 100 TPY



8

Agricultural Sector

Farmers don't get off the hook. The agricultural sector's dependence on low-cost energy is widely recognized. In addition to the obvious economic penalty associated with increased fuel costs for wheeled farm machinery, there are significant additional costs increases in fertilizer and chemical supplies directly tied to fuel prices in the agricultural sector.⁸

Just as in the commercial and industrial sectors, however, significant cost for many farming businesses may arise not just from fuel price increases but also from all of the activities associated with becoming a regulated stationary source of emissions of CO, as a new pollutant.

In counting only non-vehicular use of fossil fuels – oil, liquid petroleum gas and natural gas – nearly 20,000 farms would become regulated stationary emissions sources. (See Table 10.)

The highest impacted sectors in farming, based on the use of fossil fuels for purposes other than tractors and similar farm machinery, include poultry, grains, general crops, horticulture, vegetables and melons, fruits and livestock.

Note that Census data are very limited with regard to specific assignment of farm energy uses by either type (oil, gas, etc.), or use (stationary, or vehicles). Census farm energy use data are provided in dollars and aggregated for all purposes -- which would include vehicles, not subject to stationary source regulations analyzed here. Table 14 was used in this analysis to develop an estimated approximate average pounds of CO_2 emitted per dollar of farm energy expenditures associated only with stationary equipment.

See for example: American Farm Bureau Federation Commends Doane Advisory Services' Analysis of Lieberman-Warner Bill, The Fertilizer Institute, June 2, 2008: "Due to increasing energy prices, operating costs for corn are forecast to rise by an additional \$60.14 per acre by 2020. Potential climate change legislation will add up to \$78.80 in operating costs per acre of corn, resulting in a total increase of well over \$100 per acre by 2020."

Agricultural Sector continued

Table 10: Summary of Agricultural Sector CO₂ Emissions: Ranked by Minimum Size of Farm to Reach 250 TPY CO₂

Farm type	Size to emit 250 TPY	Average farm size	Site CO ₂ emissions	Estimated # farms regulated @ 250 TPY	Total # Farms
	Acres	Acres	lbs/acre		
Greenhouse, nursery, floriculture	640	75	780	1,400	64,000
Poultry and egg	780	140	640	1,100	44,000
Vegetable, melon	1,600	320	310	1,500	35,000
Fruit and tree nut	2,000	120	250	880	96,000
Hog and pig	2,000	250	250	560	34,000
Dairy cattle, milk production	2,900	380	170	910	73,000
Cattle feedlots	5,800	470	90	630	55,000
Other Crop Farming Total	6,300	270	80	2,600	440,000
Oil seed, grain	6,400	690	80	3,400	350,000
Animal aquaculture, other	8,700	200	60	420	230,000
Beef cattle ranching	21,000	630	20	920	660,000
Sheep and goat	23,000	410	20	50	44,000
Total				17,000	2,100,000

Appendices

Data sources, detailed data tables, summary/calculation overview

Industrial-Manufacturing Sector Data:

- o Subsector Energy Expenditures: Energy Information Administration
 - 2002 Energy Consumption by Manufacturers--Data Tables
 - Link: http://www.eia.doe.gov/emeu/mecs/mecs2002/data02/shelltables.html
 - Pertinent Tables 1.1, 9.1
- o Emissions Factors: Energy Information Administration
 - Voluntary Reporting of Greenhouse Gases Program
 - Iink: http://www.eia.doe.gov/oiaf/1605/coefficients.html

Commercial Sector Data:

- o Subsector Energy Expenditures: Energy Information Administration
 - 2003 CBECS Detailed Tables
 - http://www.eia.doe.gov/emeu/cbecs/cbecs2003/detailed_tables_2003/detailed_ tables_2003.html#consumexpen03
 - Pertinent Tables: A1, C1A, A6
- o EIA Commercial Data Contacts:
 - Joelle Michaels, CBECS Manager
 - Phone: (202) 586-8952
 - Alan Swenson
 - Phone: (202) 586-1129

Agricultural Sector Data:

- o Summary by North American Industry Classification System 2002: USDA
 - 2002 Census Publications, U.S. National Level Data
 - http://www.agcensus.usda.gov/Publications/2002/Volume_1,_Chapter_1_US/ index.asp
 - Pertinent Tables: 59 Summary by North American Industry Classification System: 2002
- o Contacts:
 - 202 694 5059 ERS: Donnell Royster
 - 18007279540 NASS
 - 2024010523 Jim Duffield
- o Agriculture Energy Information
 - "On-Farm Energy Use Characterizations," Brown, Elliott, American Council for an Energy-Efficient Economy, March 2005

General Energy Information

- o gasoline: (dec)
 - http://www.eia.doe.gov/pub/oil_gas/petroleum/data_publications/weekly_petroleum_ status_report/historical/2003/2003_08_27/txt/table17.txt
- o diesel: (dec)
 - http://www.eia.doe.gov/pub/oil_gas/petroleum/data_publications/weekly_petroleum_ status_report/historical/2003/2003_08_27/txt/table17.txt
- o natural gas: (commercial) http://tonto.eia.doe.gov/dnav/ng/ng_sum_lsum_dcu_nus_a.htm
- o electricity: (commercial) http://www.eia.doe.gov/cneaf/electricity/epa/epat7p4.html
- o petroleum: http://usasearch.gov

Table 11: Industrial-Manufacturing Sector Data

 Total Oil Natural Gas Net Electricity 	r∽ Total Qil ∽ Natural Gas	r- Total Oil		∞ Total coal	Total site CO2 emissions in sect	€ Site CO ₂ emission	Size to emit 250 TPY	250 TPY Reg Hu 언 dle hit compared avg size estab	Estimated # estal ⇔ lishments regulat @ 250TPY	Total Site CO₂ ⇄ emissions subje to reg	CO ₂ Emissions fro kWh @1.3lb/kW	Electricity CO, emissions allocated to site	Floorspace to reach 250 TPY from electric us
million billion million KWh cuft bbl	lltion million su ft bbl	bbl		million short tons	Million	bs/ so ft	sq ft	0 %	p . Count	million	E million fors	lbs/sq ft	sq ft
67521 567 5	567 5	5	+	æ	55	146	3425	3.3	14837	5	4	117	4278
7639 45 0	45 0	-		-	5	55	9032	5.5	1551	5	2	55	9113
25271 73 1	73 1			4	7	57	8841	4.4	2198	7	16	130	3851
4875 28 0	28 0	0		0	2	15	33482	33.3	2882	-	m	28	17751
3588 16 0	16 0	0	_	ò	-	17	28906	67.4	3647	1	2	42	11899
716 4 0	4 0	0		0	0	14	35417	93.8	364	0	-	27	18264
20985 56 2	56 2	~		0	4	19	25944	40.2	8377	е С	14	61	8156
65503 490 18	90 18	₽		11	63	218	2296	1.3	4230	63	43	147	3406
1579 23 1	23 1	-		0	2	615	325	0.2	34	2		342	1461
14714 45 0	45 0	0	—	0	3	12	40093	108.4	9265	-	₽	4	11318
37186 854 7	54 7	2		0	54	1397	358	0.6	1910	य	24	620	807
35478 799 4	99 4	4		0	50	2490	80	0.0	215	50	23	1153	434
153104 2,246 16	246 16	6		16	179	533	868	0.8	8872	178	100	296	1688
53181 125 1	25 1			0	8	24	24077	25.6	9189	7	35	90	5547
41393 411 6	11 6	9		14	09	239	2095	2.8	11432	59	27	107	4655
12471 21 1	4	-		÷	27	4933	41	0.1	195	27	8	1474	339
1353 7 0	7 0	0		3	7	14700	14	0.1	65	7	-	1759	284
144502 686 3	86 3	3	_	34	121	440	1136	0.6	4152	121	94	342	1464
53915 406 2	06 2	~		32	66	1248	160	0.1	771	66	35	441	1134
0 19 0	0 6	。		0	-	81	2456	0.7	41	1	0	0	N/A
47123 204 1	04	-		0	13	8	25130	51.9	26177	9	31	48	10423
24563 80 0	0	0	-	0	5	12	42969	59.5	12208	3	16	39	12918
38352 64 0	0	0		•	4	12	43294	45.0	7161	3	25	75	6999
13001 21 0	1 0	0		0	-	26	19048	10.8	547	1	8	176	2840
13901 52 0	2 0	ò		0	3	20	24760	20.2	3493	9	6	58	8549
50508 198 2	98 2	2		0	13	23	21686	9.7	7282	12	ee	59	8460
7062 24 0	4 0	0		0	-	9	82118	135.1	3550	0	5	19	25761
10374 31 0	1 0	0		0	2	6	53763	135.2	5059	Ŧ	7	34	14830
832061 6,298 67	2 38 67	67		100	640	120	4158	5.2	190314	627	541		

* Calculations are for 100 TPY

Industrial-Manufacturing Sector Data: Explanation of data/calculations for Table 11

Columns 1 - 8: primary data from http://www.eia.doe.gov/emeu/mecs/mecs2002/data02/shelltables.html

Columns 9 - 17: calculated values/estimates as follows.

- 9. CO₂ emissions from combustion of natural gas (6), oil (7), coal (8) are a added to yield total tons CO₂ for sector business.
- 10. Total emissions (9) divided by that sector's total square footage of all business in that sector (4) yields avg CO₂ lbs/sq ft
- 11. Divide 250 tons (500,000 lbs) by emissions per square foot (10) to yield size of operation that triggers 250 TPY
- 12. Divide the average 250 TPY trigger size (11) by the average size of facilities in that sector (3).
- 13. Rough estimate of number of establishments above 250 TPY by assuming: a) if size to trigger 250 TPY (11) is less than average size of establishment in that sector (3), then start with 50% of all establishments get regulated, then b) calculate how many more than 50% (i.e., "average") get regulated by using the ratio of trigger/overage (12) as the % additional that are smaller than average that are regulated. Thus if the 250 TPY trigger occurs at 30% of the average size of an operation, and assume for this example the sector has 15,000 establishments, then a) 7,500 establishments are regulated (the 50%, or "average), plus b) 70% (100 - 30%) of the remaining 7,500 establishments would be subject to regulation since only 30% of the average size is required to reach 250 TPY. (This calculation is done in reverse if the 250 TPY trigger is larger than the average size.) While this method is crude, at the broad statistical abstraction level, it yields a reasonable ballpark. There is no other means to estimate the distribution since the primary Census data does not provide granular information on energy use, but just overall totals, and overall averages. This method could both over, or under estimate. But it is notable regarding any potential overestimate of regulated establishments - such is likely, on average, to be more than offset by the entire data set's general underestimate of regulated establishments because the Census data is incomplete (i.e., undercounts by roughly 50%) total industrial energy use - Census/DOE does not have complete data for all companies which do not report all disaggregated data (for competitive reasons, or because of Census collection issues).
- 14. Total sector CO₂ emissions (10) are multiplied by ratio of number of regulated establishments (13) compared to total establishments (2).
- 15. Electric utility emissions of CO₂ associated with sector electric use (5) based on national average fuel use (and thus CO, emissions) for utility sector.
- 16. Sector electric-related emissions (15) divided by total square footage of that sector (4) to yield indirect CO, emissions per square foot from kWh use.
- 17. kWh-related CO₂ emissions (16) divided in to 250 TPY to yield number of square feet of operations that lead to 250 TPY trigger occurring at utilities for that specific industrial sector's average.

Table 12: Commercial Sector Data

27	Electricity as share total energy	%	78	94	76	75	74	69	68	79	82	65	76	84	82	62	82
26	Floorspace to reach 250 TPY from electric use	1000 sq ft	34	8	10	16	28	19	22	30	24	2	35	53	17	218	26
25	Electricity CO, emissions allocated to site	lbs/sq ft	15	65	52	31	18	26	23	17	21	g	14	9	30	2	20
24	Electric CO ₂	millon tons	73	41	43	49	46	144	141	33	Ξ	5	29	48	8	3	669
23	Total \rm{CO}_2 emitted (incl from kWh)	million tons	113	46	67	B0	78	179	176	50	16	25	46	65	37	6	987
22	Total Site CO ₂ emissions subject to reg	million tons	29	4	₽	25	23	25	26	8	2		ы.	÷	S	o	181
21	Estimated # buildings regulated @ 250 TPY	1000	102	23	28	92	11	139	260	26	~	37	67	151	®0	0	1374
20	# sq ft regulated ("Notes)	millions	2606	126	323	2246	2562	2367	3858	365	109	375	433	2652	174	0	20263
19	Size to emit 250 TPY	(1000 sq ft)	124	134	34	51	81	160	174	117	114	148	121	292	83	382	124
18	Site CO ₂ emissions	ibs/sq ft	4	4	15	10	9	3	3	4	4	Э	4	2	6	Ŧ	77
17	Avg oil used	1000 Btu/sq ft	5	0	•	3	2	2	-	7	~	5	0	1	•	•	ŝ
16	Avg gas used	1990 Btu/sq ft	27	31	123	2	42	24	22	26	27	ង	3	13	ß	ŧ	29
15	total annual fuel oil consumption	trillion Btu	47	0	0	÷	35	24	18	29	80	₽	0	6	•	0	228
14	total annual gas consumption	trillion Btu	268	39	203	243	215	264	269	102	29	82	139	132	87	28	2,100
13	total annual electricity consumption	trillion Btu	1,121	629	654	748	602	2,214	2,170	506	172	188	451	738	401	\$	10,746
12	Floor space	million sq ft	9,874	1,255	1,654	3,163	5,096	11,192	12,208	3,939	1,090	3,754	4,050	10,078	1,738	2,567	71,658
11	Over 500,000 sq ft		σ	z	z	973	æ	1,905	2,365	σ	ø	N	σ	ø	٥	σ	7,660
10	200,001 to 500,000 sq ft		1,420	z	a	514	1,185	462	1,493	σ	ð	ð	ð	a	ð	σ	7,494
6	100,001 to 200,900 sq ft	is sq ft	2,167	a	z	395	630	1,677	1,428	368	ø	۵	۵	1,162	Q	ø	10,217
80	50,001 to 100,000 sq ft	e — millior	2,690	a	a	364	841	1,505	1,209	474	a	ø	a	1,494	ø	σ	10,291
7	25,001 to 50,000 sq ft	lour spac	1,756	a	Ţ	157	803	1,291	1,506	<u>8</u>	a	830	260	1,043	ø	471	9,382
9	10,000 to 25,000 sq ft	Total	831	a	345	313	631	2,409	1,887	1,077	٥	1,235	1,021	2,064	a	a	12,659
5	5,001 to 10,000 sq ft		399	356	442	8 2	9 <u>5</u>	1,173	826	518	a	744	722	868	a	a	7,033
4	1,001 to 5, 000 sq ft		409	409	544	165	66	111	1,382	336	122	416	1,034	895	ð	239	6,922
3	Mean floor space per building	x1000	8	9	9	25	36	4	15	14	16	10	7	17	ង	7	15
2	Total#bldgs	x1000	386	226	297	129	142	857	824	277	71	370	622	597	79	182	4,859
-	Business type		Education	Food Sales	Food Service	Health Care	Lodging	Mercantile	Office	Public Assembly	Public Order and Safety	Religious Worship	Service	Warehouse, Storage	Other	Vacant	Total

Commercial Sector Data: Explanation of data/calculations for Table 12

Columns 1 – 15: primary data from

http://www.eia.doe.gov/emeu/cbecs/cbecs2003/detailed_tables_2003/detailed_tables_2003. html#consumexpen03

Columns 16 - 27: calculated values/estimates as follows.

- 16. Divide total sector gas use (13) by total square footage (12) to yield avg gas used per sq ft
- 17. Ditto re oil
- 18. Calculate site CO₂ emissions by adding avg emissions per sq foot from gas, and oil by first converting gas or oil use to CO₂ emissions.
- 19. Divide 250 tons (as pounds) by avg pounds emitted per square foot (18) to yield avg size space that hits 250 TPY
- 20. To estimate how many square feet are subject to regulation, add up the number of square feet less than the trigger (19) from the disaggregated data in columns (4) (11). Pro-rate the number of square feet in the relevant column where the average (19) falls in the relevant range in columns (4) (11).
- 21. Estimate, roughly, number of buildings regulated by assuming share of total square footage regulated is approx the same as share of total buildings in that sector regulated. Share of square footage calculated by dividing (20) by (12) multiply this ratio by total buildings in the sector (2).
- 22. Multiply same ratio in (21) by total sector emissions latter calculated by multiplying emissions per sq ft (18) by total square footage in sector (12).
- 23. Multiply sector total electric use (13) by national average utility CO₂ emissions per kWh add to total site CO₂ emissions (18).
- 24. As above without site CO₂ emissions.
- 25. Calculate utility emissions associated with kWh by dividing sector kWh CO₂ (24) by total square footage (12)
- 26. Calculate same way as (19).
- 27. Divide primary energy to make electricity (13) by total sector energy use.

Table 13: Agricultural Sector Data

16	Total CO ₂ emission incl on-site vehicles	lbs/ sq ft	50	15	3	2	9	7	8	2	4	2	3	0	2	24
15	Estimated # farms regulated @ 250 TPY	count	14,382	3,447	1,499	882	1,433	2,576	920	633	909	555	1,062	50	416	16,958
14	Size to emit 250 TPY	Acres	7,321	6,428	1,628	1,989	637	6,305	21,255	5,848	2,918	2,018	780	23,463	8,700	
13	Site CO ₂ emissions	lbs/ acre	68	78	307	251	785	79	24	86	171	248	641	21	57	
12	TOTAL Site CO ₂ emissions subject to reg	million tons	32	6	2	-	2	5	5	1	2	F	2	0	1	37
11	64% Share All Energy pur- chases not for vehicles	\$million	4,272	1,256	230	193	252	626	858	148	312	137	263	25	171	
t 0	ises of	\$50,000+	14,382	3,447	1,499	882	1,433	2,576	920	633	606	555	1,062	50	416	
6	el, oil exper	\$25,000 - \$49,999	29,049	9,816	1,467	1,264	1,472	4,971	2,470	970	2,129	1,112	2,478	72	828	
8	with gas, fu	\$5,000 - \$24,999	242,029	95,273	4,711	8,016	7,502	27,038	39,440	6,735	23,524	7,727	14,015	978	7,070	
7	Farms	\$1 - 4,999	1,738,679	231,615	24,765	83,938	50,194	377,832	606,388	44,677	44,487	22,437	25,184	40,363	186,763	
9	total annual purchases - gasoline, fuels, oils	1000 \$US	6,675,419	1,962,572	358,743	301,769	393,875	977,535	1,028,713	231,441	488,176	214,618	411,022	39,759	267,197	
5	Average size of farm	\$US	97,320	115,964	382,581	141,680	234,219	36,372	30,902	415,480	323,182	369,531	552,989	10,815	19,034	
4	Average farm size	Acres	441	694	324	120	75	267	632	8 9 1	377	247	139	408	196	
3	Land in farms	acres	938,279,056	242,218,224	11,215,546	11,525,130	4,819,149	118,327,994	419,821,930	25,984,434	27,351,777	8,317,127	6,153,409	17,910,791	44,633,545	
2	Total # Farms	count	2,128,982	349,023	34,624	95,680	64,366	442,932	664,431	55,472	72,537	33,655	44,219	43,891	228,152	
	Farm type		TOTAL	Oil seed, grain	Vegetable, melon	Fruit and tree nut	Greenhouse, nursery, floriculture	Other Crop Farming Total	Beef cattle ranching	Cattle feedlots	Dairy cattle, milk production	Hog and pig	Poultry and egg	Sheep and goat	Animal aquaculture, other	TOTAL from calculations

Agricultural Data: Explanation of data/calculations for Table 13

Columns 1 - 10: primary data from

http://www.agcensus.usda.gov/Publications/2002/Volume_1,_Chapter_1_US/index.asp

Columns 11 - 16: calculated values/estimates as follows.

- 11. Share of total energy purchases used for stationary equipment (non-vehicle) derived from Table 14. Data set in Table 13 and 14 both for year 2002 – permitting consistent transfer of derived value.
- Conversion factor (16 lbs CO₂/\$) for average CO₂ emissions per energy \$ spent derived from Table
 Multiply (16) by 16 lbs/\$ and convert to tons.
- 13. Divide (12) by total acres per category (3)
- 14. Divide 250 TPY by (13)
- 15. 250 TPY in 2002 ~ \$50,000 of fuel expenditures thus only farms in (10) subject to regulation.
- 16. Multiply total fuel spending for all purposes (6) by average emissions per \$ (16 lbs per Table 14).

Agricultural Data: Explanation of data/calculations for Table 14

Columns 1 – 7: data from "On-Farm Energy Use Characterizations," American Council for an Energy-Efficient Economy, March 2005.

Columns 11 - 16: calculated values/estimates as follows.

- 8. Convert BTU data from (2) to (7) to relevant units (gallons oil, cubic feet n gas, kWh electricity).
- 9. Fuel units
- 10. Cost per unit of relevant fuel in 2002 (DOE/EIA national average data)
- 11. Expenditures for each fuel type: total at bottom of column all non-electric spending of \$8,415 million.
- 12. Calculate CO₂ emissions; multiply BTU in (7) by CO2/BTU for each fuel type
- 13. Divide (12) by (11) to yield lbs CO₂/\$ spent on each fuel type: bottom of column derive straight statistical avg of 16 lbs CO₂/\$ of fuel purchases.
- 14. Estimate share of each fuel type associated with stationary source equipment (non-vehicle) from statistical avg of (18) through (22)
- 15. Multiply (14) by (11) for total spending on non-vehicle energy: total column \$5,348 million divide by total for all non-electric energy spending (11) to yield 64% share of energy spending for stationary uses.
- 16. Multiply (15) by 16 lbs/\$ for total CO₂ emissions from non-vehicle
- 17. Same categories as (1)
- 18 22. Estimate share of fuel used for non-vehicle purposes based on category of use (e.g., 0% of "onsite transportation" energy is for stationary; but estimate 75% of all "machinery" is stationary.



Table 13: Agricultural Energy End-Uses

22	other not categorized	*		2	80	6	8						
21	machinery	%		75	75	•	75						snsus
2D	onsite transport	%		0	•	,	,	elow)					59 C
19	total lighting	%		'	'	,	0	total b					h Table
18	total motors	%		50	8	100	75	led in					ere wit
17	ESTIMATED SHARE STATIONARY	_	total - all farm-fypes	gasoline	diesel	natural gas	other (a)	(KWh not cour					g kWh) result h
16	Total Emissions CO ₂ non-mobile	mil- lion fons		ŷ	21	5	8	29		69			excluding
15	Total Expenditures for non-mobile energy use	and Ton		886	2868	529	1065	•		5348			f energy {
14	Estimated share stationary sources (d)	%		15	73	06	22	0		Avg lbs			rchases" o
13	CO2	\$/sdi		13	15	20	15	16		16			"Total Pu
12	Total CO ₂	miltion tons		4	29	9	16	29		62	excludes kWh		Note: compare ' total of ~\$
11	Total Expenditures	mil- Hon \$		1753	3943	885	2130	3538		11953	8415		
10	Cost/Unit (c)	US (cents)		142	142	600	142	8	73.7/gallon				
6				gallons	gallons	cubic feet	gallons	кwh					
8	Energy Units (b)		million	1,235	2,777	98,000	1,500	44,842					
7	total			142	361	38	195	153	796	949			
6	other not categorized			5	249	94	169	136	517	653			
5	machinery			-	77		2	,	8	8			
4	onsite transport			7	28	١.	,	•	8	8			
3	total lighting			1	•		2	ŝ	2	5			
2	total motors			134	7	2	15	6	158	167			
1			total - all farm-types	gasoline	diesel	natural gas	other (a)	electricity	total petroleum	total energy		ACEE pg. 7	(a) treated as diesel



U.S. Chamber of Commerce 1615 H Street NW Washington, DC 20062 www.uschamber.com